Instruments and Observing Methods Report No. 140

WEATHER CLIMATE WATER

# Report on the WMO International Pyrheliometer Comparison (IPC-XIII) (27 September - 15 October 2021, Davos, Switzerland)

W. Finsterle



This publication is available in pdf format, from the WMO Library website: <u>https://library.wmo.int/</u>

#### © World Meteorological Organization, 2023

The right of publication in print, electronic and any other form and in any language is reserved by WMO. Short extracts from WMO publications may be reproduced without authorization, provided that the complete source is clearly indicated. Editorial correspondence and requests to publish, reproduce or translate this publication in part or in whole should be addressed to:

Chair, Publications Board		
World Meteorological Organization (WMO)		
7 bis, avenue de la Paix	Tel:	+41 (0) 22 730 8403
P.O. Box 2300	Fax:	+41 (0) 22 730 8117
CH-1211 Geneva 2, Switzerland	E-mail:	Publications@wmo.int

#### NOTE

The designations employed in WMO publications and the presentation of material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of WMO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The mention of specific companies or products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by WMO in preference to others of a similar nature which are not mentioned or advertised.

The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in WMO publications with named authors are those of the authors alone and do not necessarily reflect those of WMO or its Members.

This publication has been issued without formal editing.

#### FOREWORD

The World Meteorological Organization (WMO) strategic plan recognizes the increasing demand for accessible and authoritative information on the changing states of the entire Earth. High-quality fit-for-purpose traceable measurements are essential to meet this demand.

The WMO Technical Commission for Observation, Infrastructure and Information Systems (INFCOM) has set up a Standing Committee on Measurement, Instrumentation and Traceability (SC-MINT) that coordinates activities that enable the traceability of measurement to international standards in the context of the WMO Integrated Global Observing System (WIGOS). The intercomparison presented in this report is one of those key activities.

The organization and hosting of the WMO International Pyrheliometer Comparisons (IPCs) at the Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos/World Radiation Centre (PMOD/WRC) has a long and important history. It aims at ensuring the traceability of solar radiation measurements around the world using the World Radiometric Reference (WRR) by verifying its stability and disseminating the reference to national and/or regional standard instruments, and other participating instruments such as those of universities and instrument manufacturers.

The 5-year regularity of IPCs is key to the traceability of solar radiation measurements around the world using the WRR. Exceptionally, the WMO Executive Council at its Seventy-second session agreed to the postponement of the Thirteenth International Pyrheliometer Comparison (IPC-XIII) by one year because of the pandemic and inherent travel restrictions. Organizing IPC-XIII in 2021 remained a challenge in view of the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic. Fortunately, many participants were able to travel to Davos and took part in the campaign.

This report summarizes the outcomes of the IPC-XIII and demonstrates the stability of the WRR in providing a worldwide metrological reference. Favourable weather conditions enabled acquisition of a large number of the calibration points, what increased confidence in the traceability dissemination. On the days without weather conditions appropriate to take the measurements, a symposium on radiation measurement was organized. Many presentations delivered at the symposium facilitated the experience exchange and knowledge transfer.

It has been shown that there is an apparent offset of the WRR relative to the International System of Units (SI) and that recent technological developments enable to significantly reduce the uncertainties of potential new reference instruments for solar irradiance measurements, such as the Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer (CSAR) and Monitor to Measure the Integral Transmittance of Windows (MITRA). INFCOM is envisaging a reference change to ensure stable and accurate measurements for the future while minimizing the impacts that such a change will have on climate datasets. The outcomes of this intercomparison and of the next intercomparison to be held in 2025 will be critical elements to consider towards this reference change. It is anticipated that such a reference change could be approved by the 20th World Meteorological Congress in 2027.

I wish to express my sincere appreciation to all those who contributed to the success of this intercomparison. Particularly to the staff of the World Radiation Centre for organizing this intercomparison and ensuring a safe environment for all participants, to the members of the IPC-XIII Ad-hoc committee for their review of the report and to all those who contributed to the symposium, sharing their expertise with other participants.

President of the Infrastructure Commission

Michel Jean





## Wolfgang Finsterle

pmod wrc

PMOD/WRC, Davos Dorf WMO IOM Report No. 140 2023

# Contents

1	Org	anization and Procedures	5
	1.1	Introduction	5
	1.2	Participation	5
	1.3	Data Acquisition and Evaluation	10
		1.3.1 Timing of the Measurements	10
		1.3.2 Data Evaluation	11
		1.3.3 Auxiliary Data	12
	1.4	The Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer (CSAR)	13
	1.5	Agreement of Procedures	13
2	Irrad	liance Measurements and Results	15
-	2.1	Data Selection Criteria for the Final Evaluation	15
	2.2	Status of the WSG and Transfer of the WRR	15
	2.3	Computation of the New WRR Factors	16
		2.3.1 WSG Instruments	16
		2.3.2 Participating Instruments	16
	2.4	External stability check of the WSG	21
3	Con	clusions and Recommendations	25
5	3.1	Graphical Representation of the Results	25
4	Aux	iliary Data	63
	4.1	Direct and Diffuse Irradiance	64
	4.2	Airmass and Aerosol Optical Depth (AOD)	65
	4.3	Wind Speed	66
	4.4	Meteorological Data	67
5	Svm	posium	69
•	5.1	To Build and Share Knowledge	69
~	~		
6	Sup	plementary Information	71
	6.L	Addresses of Participants	/1
	6.2	Glossary	((

### 1.1 Introduction

The 13<sup>th</sup> International Pyrheliometer Comparison (IPC-XIII) was held together with Regional Pyrheliometer Comparisons (RPCs) of all WMO Regional Associations (RA I to RA VI) from 27 September through 15 October 2021 at the Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos/World Radiation Centre (PMOD/WRC) in Davos Dorf, Switzerland. The IPC-XIII was delayed by 1 year because of international travel restrictions in response to the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020. Held concurrently with the IPC-XIII were the fifth Filter Radiometer Comparisons (FRC-V) and the third International Pyrgeometer Comparisons (IPgC-III). Results from the FRC-V and IPgC-III will be presented in separate reports.

The results presented in this report are based on the measurements carried out during the three weeks assigned to the IPC-XIII. The weather conditions allowed acquisition of a large number of calibration points for most participating instruments. Seminar presentations were given on days when the weather conditions did not allow measurements to be taken.

## 1.2 Participation

Due to the on-going COVID-19 restrictions not all Regional Radiation Centres (RRC) were able to delegate a representative to the IPC-XIII. Instead, pyrheliometers sent from RRCs without operators were operated by WRC staff, resulting in 103 pyrheliometers from 40 institutions (1 WRC, 9 RRCs, 12 NRCs, 6 manufacturers, 3 National Metrology Institutes (NMI), 3 universities, 6 solar energy industry) representing 26 countries and the European Commission that were present for the comparison. The six World Standard Group (WSG) instruments (PMO2, PMO5, CROM2L, PAC3, HF18748, MK67814) and the Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer (CSAR), were operated by the WRC staff. See Tables 1.1 and 1.2 for a complete list of all participating centres and institutions. Two representatives of WMO attended the first couple of days of IPC-XIII.

Table 1.1: IPC-XIII Participants: WMO World, Regional and National RadiationCentres

Country	Туре	Institution	Operator(s)	Instrument(s)
World Radiati	ion Cen	ter		
Switzerland RA I (Africa)	WRC	Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos, World Radiation Centre, Davos	Wolfgang Finsterle Ricco Soder Natalia Engler Christian Thomann David Schweizer Julian Gröbner Stelios Kazadzis Natalia Kouremeti	PMO2 <sup>1</sup> PMO5 CROM2L PAC3 HF18748 MK67814 NIP-31144E6 EPAC11402 PMO6-79-122 AHF32455 CSAR PMO6-0304 PMO6-0401 PMO6-0401 PMO6-0803 SIAR-2A PMO6-0803 SIAR-2A PMO8-F201-007A PMO6-7 (Me- teoswiss, NRC) PMO6-7 (Me- teoswiss, NRC) PMO6-0808 (China, NRC) PMO6-1109 (Croatia, NRC) PMO6-1603 (Japan, RRC) PMO6-1610 (In- donesia, NRC)
Algeria	RRC	Office National de la Météorolo- gie	Ben Mohammed	AHF29225
Egypt	RRC	Egyptian Meteorolgical Auth., Cairo	Khaled Wael	AHF31103
Libya	NRC	Libyan Center for Solar Energy Research and Studies, Tripoli	Akram Essnid	CHP1-131107

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The WSG pyrheliometers are printed in **boldface**. In normal print are other WRC pyrheliometers, unless indicated otherwise.

Table 1.1: (continued)

Country	Туре	Institution	Operator(s)	Instrument(s)			
RA II (Asia)							
Saudi Arabia	NRC	K.A.CARE, Riyadh	Abdullah Al Adwani Saad Al Qahtani Abdulhakim Bin Dayil	AHF30110			
RA III (South America)							
Uruguay	NRC	Laboratorio de Energía Solar, Universidad de la República, Salto	Augustín Laguarda Paola Russo	CHP1-150261			
RA IV (North	Americ	a, Central America and the Ca	ribbean)				
Mexico	RRC	Instituto de Geofísica, UNAM México, DF	Adirana Elizabeth Gonzalez	AHF29223 PMO6-1102			
RA V (South-	West P	acific)					
RA VI (Europ	e)						
Belgium	RRC	Royal Meteorological Institute, Uccle	Christian Conscience Joannes Nevens Julien Amand Pierre Malcorps Luca Schifano	CR05L CR09R			
Czech Repub- lic	NRC	Czech. Hydromet. Institute, Hradec Kralove	Jiri Pokorny	HF30497			
Germany	RRC	DWD Met. Obs. Lindenberg, Tauche OT Lindenberg	Stefan Wacker Lionel Doppler	AHF29221 <sup>2</sup> HF27157 PMO6-5 PMO6-0405			
Russian Fed- eration	RRC WRDC	Voeikov MGO, St. Petersburg	Vladislav Iakovlev Artem Rodionov	PMO6-0817			
Slovakia	NRC	SHMI, Poprad-Ganovce	Anna Pribullová	AHF37814			
Slovenia	NRC	Slovenian Environment Agency, Ljubljana	Marko Svetličič Iztok Miklavžina	PMO6-1103 CHP1-140049			
Sweden	RRC	SMHI, Norrköping	Thomas Carlund	PMO8-F201-006A AWX 33393			

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$ This pyrheliometer was operated in active mode with the LINARD controller s/n P00.

Country	Туре	Institution	Operator(s)	Instrument(s)
The Nether- lands	NRC	KNMI, De Bilt	Wouter Knap Izzy Hendriks	AHF27159 CHP1-200837 CHP1-200838
United King- dom of Great Britain and Northern Ire- land	NRC	Met Office, Exeter, Devon	David Hiscock Sanghera Sandeep	AHF31110 AHF37813

#### Table 1.1: (continued)

Table 1.2: IPC-XIII Participants: *Manufacturers, metrology, research, and industrial institutions* 

Country	Institution	Participant(s)	Instrument(s)
Chile	Universidad de Santiago de Chile, Santiago	Edgardo Sepúlveda José Jorgue Torres	PMO6-1602 SHP1-195181
Denmark	Technical University of Den- mark, Kgs. Lyngby	Adam Jensen	SHP1-185163 SHP1-205241
Germany	PTB, Braunschweig (NMI)	Dirk Friedrich	PMO6-1104 PMO8-F201-001 PMO8-F201-002 SHP1-130042 SHP1-175109 SHP1-175110
Italy	European Commission JRC, Ispra, Varese	Willem Zaaiman Diego Pavanello Harald Müllejans	PMO6-81109 PMO6-911204 AHF0000 NIP-21451E6 NIP-23927E6 NIP-25738E6 NIP-26626E5 CH1-060460 CH1-930018 CH1-040370 CHP1-110533 MS56-12036 MS56-12039 MS57-1702504 TMI67604 TMI67604
The Nether- lands	EKO Instruments, The Hague	Mario Po	PMO6-0816 MS56-P12023

Country	Institution	Participant(s)	Instrument(s)
Japan	Ishikawa Trading Co., Ltd., Tokyo	Kazuhiko Ohkubo	IRS04-2101 (AIST, RENRC) IRS04-2102 AHF33396 (AIST, RENRC)
Sweden	RISE Research Institute of Sweden (NMI), Borås	Anne Andersson Stefan Källberg Mikael Lindgren	HF15744
Spain	CIEMAT, Madrid	Jose Balenzategui	AHF28486 PMO6-0301 PMO6-1609 SNIP-37886E6
Switzerland	Davos Instruments	Markus Suter Jon Buchli Valeria Büchel	PMO6-1611 PMO8-F211-001 PMO8-F211-002 PMO8-F201-009 (Argentina, RRC)
The Nether- lands	Hukseflux Thermal Sensors, Delft	Kees van den Bos Chiel Donkers Jürgen Konings	CP20C-101 CP20C-102 CP20U-101 CP20U-102 DR02-9210 DR20-65033 DR30-65005
The Nether- lands	Kipp & Zonen BV (Ott Hy- dromet), Delft	Erik Nagel Joop Mees	PMO6-0103 SHP33-01 CHP1-REF2 PH1-999991
USA	Argonne National Lab, Billings OK	Craig Webb	AHF28968
USA	National Renewable Energy Lab., Golden CO	Ibrahim Reda Afshin Andreas	AHF23734 AHF29220 AHF30713 TMI68018
USA	The Eppley Laboratory Inc., Newport RI	Tom Kirk	AHF14915 AHF27798 AHF32449 AHF37812 (Korea)
USA	ISO-CAL North America, LCC, Phoenix AZ	Erik Naranen	AHF37816 AHF28560

Table 1.2: (continued)

Table 1.2: (	(continued)
--------------	-------------

Country	Institution	Participant(s)	Instrument(s)
USA	University of Oregon, Solar Radiation Monitoring Lab, Eugene	Josh Peterson	AHF34926

## 1.3 Data Acquisition and Evaluation

The signals from the WSG instruments and additional WRC and RRC radiometers were acquired by a data acquisition system based on 18 National Instruments PXI-4065 6.5-digit digital multimeters with NI PXI-2501 24-channel multiplexers. The system was controlled by a LabView application ("DAQ2010") running on an industrial PC and operated flawlessly. A separate LabView application triggered the aural and visual timing signals on the measurement field as well as the initialization and readout of the data entry forms for manually operated instruments (see below). This system is very robust and flexible, allowing pyrheliometers to be added/removed to/from the comparison without re-initializing the DAQ2010 software. All measurements were analyzed and visualized with an IDL software package on a separate PC in near-real-time.

The participating pyrheliometers were operated with their standard pointing and data acquisition equipment, either manually or automated.

The data from the manually operated instruments were typed into a web application by the operators. WLAN connections were used to initialize the web application and to upload the readings to a dedicated directory on the PMOD/WRC FTP server, from where it was fetched by the data analysis and visualisation computer (IDL). Written records were kept for backup purposes and to double-check for typing errors in the web application.

Computer controlled data acquisition systems had to run on CET (Central European Standard Time) and be synchronized to the basic measurement cadence (see below). Participants could up-load their data files to the dedicated directory on the FTP server from where they were fetched by the IDL computer. The prescribed file naming and format convention with three columns corresponding to date, time, and irradiance was observed by most participants. All data were ingested into the data acquisition and evaluation system at the end of each measurement day.

### 1.3.1 Timing of the Measurements

The measurements were taken in series of 21 minutes with a basic interval of 90 seconds. The starting time of each series was either on the full hour or the minute xx:30. Where needed, electrical calibrations and/or zero readings were completed *before* the starting time<sup>3</sup>. Voice announcements and acoustic signals together with a visual indicator on the measurement field informed the participants about the starting times and progress of the measurement series. A network time server or a digital reference clock on the measurement field could be used to synchronize all data acquisition systems.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Manually operated radiometers which were using the web interface for submitting the data started their calibration sequence and/or zero reading on the starting time of the series. Hence they acquired slightly fewer irradiance readings per series.

The time until the next measurement was also indicated on the web interface for manual operators. The timing for each type of instrument was as follows<sup>4</sup>:

- PAC3: the calibration phase started with the shutter closed and the electrical heater<sup>5</sup> switched on for 40 seconds (this was introduced after IPC-III in order to have a well defined thermal state of the instrument independent of the operation sequence before the run). The zero of the thermopile was read 90 seconds after the heater had been switched off again. Then the heater was switched on for another 90 seconds before the heater voltage, current and the thermopile signal were read. The calibration sequence ends with the shutter open command 90 seconds before the starting time of the series. Each series produced 14 irradiance readings at 90-second interval. After the last reading the shutter was closed.
- HF- and TMI-type pyrheliometers: the calibration phase started with the shutter closed, after 90 seconds the thermopile zero was read and the electrical heater<sup>5</sup> turned on during 90 seconds. At the end of the heating phase the heater voltage, current and thermopile signal were read. The calibration sequence ends with the shutter open command, 90 seconds before the starting time of the series. Each series produced 14 irradiance readings at 90-second interval (11 irradiance readings via the web interface). After the last reading the shutter was closed.
- PMO-, SIAR- and CROM-type pyrheliometers: The measurements started with a reference phase (shutter closed) of 90 seconds, followed by a measurement phase (shutter open) of 90 seconds. The closed and open heater voltage and current are read at the end of each reference or measurement phase<sup>6</sup>. This reference/measurement sequence was repeated seven times, followed by an additional reference phase, yielding 7 open and 8 closed readings during each run (6 open and 7 closed via the web interface). PMO2 was read at twice that pace, with a reference phase of 45 seconds and a measurement phase of 45 seconds, producing 13 irradiance values per series. Note that for PMO2 the *open* heater current and voltage were read 6 times in rapid succession (200 ms interval) to assess the atmospheric stability.
- Field pyrheliometers with thermopile sensor (NIP, CHP1, MS56, DR0x, etc.): These pyrheliometers started with a zero reading 90 seconds before the starting time of the series, followed by the shutter open command. The thermopile signal was then recorded every 90 seconds<sup>6</sup>, yielding 14 irradiance readings (13 irradiance readings via web interface).
- Computerized and prototype pyrheliometers (e.g. CSAR, see Sect. 1.4) were using various modes of operation which are specific to their design. Their measurements were synchronized to the 90-seconds base cadence. The irradiance values were calculated according to the instrument-specific algorithms before being submitted to the FTP server in the standardized format.

#### 1.3.2 Data Evaluation

For each instrument the irradiance was calculated according to the appropriate evaluation procedure as listed below. After each day a graphical print-out of the ratios to PMO2 was put on the FTP server to be reviewed by the participants. This simple but effective measure of quality control revealed instrumental problems in several cases which subsequently could be fixed quickly.

"Quick-look" print-outs were also produced at any time during the measurement day when an instrument was suspected to malfunction.

 $<sup>^{4}</sup>$ This timing scheme applies to all WRC radiometers and radiometers that were connected to the WRC data acquisition system. Radiometers which were controlled by their own computer may have deviated partially from this scheme.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>The heater voltage was manually selected before each series to match the expected level of solar irradiance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>The integration time varies between instrument types and between individual instruments from instantaneous up to 2 seconds.

The procedure used to calculate the irradiance S of each instrument type is described below. The notations are:

- $V_{\rm th}$   $\qquad$  output of the thermopile
- $U_{\rm h},\,U_{\rm i}$   $\,$  voltage across the heater (index h) or across the standard resistor (index i)
- $R_n$  standard resistor (For PMOx-type radiometers  $R_n$  is often included in  $C_1$ .)
- C<sub>1</sub> calibration factor (see Table 2.2)
- C<sub>2</sub> correction factor for lead heating (see Table 2.2)
- P electrical power in the active cavities
  - PAC3, HF, and TMI type pyrheliometers: the irradiance was calculated from the thermopile output  $V_{\rm th}({\rm irrad})$  when the receiver was irradiated. The sensitivity was determined by the calibration during which the cavity was shaded and electrically heated and  $U_{\rm h}$  and  $U_{\rm i}$  were measured together with the corresponding thermopile output  $V_{\rm th}({\rm cal})$ . Furthermore, the zero of the thermopile  $V_{\rm th}({\rm zero})$  was measured and subtracted from all thermopile readings.

$$\mathsf{S} = \mathsf{C}_1 \frac{\mathsf{V}_{\mathrm{th}}(\mathsf{irrad}) - \mathsf{V}_{\mathrm{th}}(\mathsf{zero})}{\mathsf{V}_{\mathrm{th}}(\mathsf{cal}) - \mathsf{V}_{\mathrm{th}}(\mathsf{zero})} \frac{\mathsf{U}_{\mathrm{i}}}{\mathsf{R}_{\mathrm{n}}} \left(\mathsf{U}_{\mathrm{h}} - \frac{\mathsf{U}_{\mathrm{i}}}{\mathsf{R}_{\mathrm{n}}}\mathsf{C}_2\right)$$

• PMO-, SIAR- and CROM-type pyrheliometers: the irradiance was obtained from P(closed) averaged from the closed values before and after the open reading P(open).

$$\mathsf{S} = \mathsf{C}_1(\mathsf{P}(\mathsf{closed}) - \mathsf{P}(\mathsf{open}))$$

The power calculation was done according to the prescription of the instrument type with

$$\mathsf{P}=\mathsf{U}_h^2 \qquad \text{or} \qquad \mathsf{P}=\mathsf{U}_h\mathsf{U}_i \qquad \text{or} \qquad \mathsf{P}=\mathsf{U}_h\frac{\mathsf{U}_i}{\mathsf{R}_n}$$

The SIAR-type radiometers slightly deviate from this scheme in that they subtract the open power from the *preceding* closed power rather than the average of the preceding and successive closed reading.

- Field Pyrheliometers with thermopile sensor: the thermopile reading was divided by the calibration factor after subtraction of the zero point reading<sup>7</sup>.
- PMO2: As during preceding IPCs, PMO2 was used as the reference instrument for the daily summaries because it can be operated fast enough to provide an irradiance value every 90 seconds. The values of PMO2 were obtained with the algorithm for PMO-type pyrheliometers. At the end of the open phase, 6 readings were taken in rapid succession within 1 second. The standard deviation of the 6 readings was used during the final evaluation as a quality control parameter to assess the atmospheric stability during each acquisition sequence (see Sect. 2.1).

#### 1.3.3 Auxiliary Data

The meteorological parameters (air temperature, relative humidity, atmospheric pressure) were obtained from the MeteoSwiss' automated weather station SwissMetNet located at PMOD/WRC (see Sect. 4.4). Two anemometers were measuring wind speed and direction, one on the measurement field and one above the WSG tracker.

The WRC's Infrared Cloud Camera (IRCCAM) was used to flag all measurements when clouds were too close to the sun (see Sect, 2.1.

Precision Filter Radiometers (PFR) were used to determine Aerosol Optical Depth (AOD) at four wavelengths (367.6 nm, 412.0 nm, 501.2 nm, and 862.4 nm, see Sect. 4.2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Some operators assumed a vanishing zero signal. They did not perform zero readings.

## 1.4 The Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer (CSAR)

The CSAR is a prototype pyrheliometer which aims at exploiting the benefits of cryogenic radiometry in a pyrheliometer that directly measures solar irradiance. Thanks to the CSAR's traceability to SI primary standards its irradiance measurements are expected to have a 10-fold improved uncertainty compared to the WRR. The CSAR is operated in a mode which is similar to HF- and TMI-type pyrheliometers, although its reference block is actively stabilized at 30 K by a PID controller. After each operation of the shutter the PID controller requires up to 15 minutes to stabilize the reference block. Therefore, the standard 20-minutes measurement series are not feasible for the CSAR. It was thus operated separately from the rest of the pyrheliometers. After the reference block was stabilized, irradiance readings were carried out every 7 seconds. This cadence is limited by the precision thermometry bridge (ISOTECH microK) reading the Cernox<sup>®</sup> thermistors on the CSAR cavity and reference block.

In a next step, the attenuation of the solar irradiance by the Suprasil<sup>®</sup> entrance window to the CSAR's vacuum tank needs to be corrected. The attenuation factor depends on the spectral composition of the solar irradiance – and thus the atmospheric conditions – at the time of the measurement. The Monitor for Integrated Transmittance (MITRA) is a 2-channel differential ambient-temperature radiometer which measures the attenuation factor of an identical window simultaneously with each irradiance reading by the CSAR. The MITRA attenuation factors are then used to correct the CSAR irradiance measurements.

In order to detect and account for a possible non-equivalence of both windows the optical path of the CSAR is equipped with a vacuum gate which allows to swap the CSAR and MITRA windows in the course of the day. The swapping procedure requires roughly 1 hour, during which the CSAR cannot measure the solar irradiance.

Unfortunately the measurement conditions and the operational stability of the CSAR did not offer opprotunities to swap the windows during IPC-XIII without risking the loss too much data. However, the non-equivalence between the two windows was determined several times. It was found that the attenuation factor of the CSAR window is consistently 0.16% lower than the MITRA window. The attenuation factors measured by MITRA were corrected accordingly before being applied to the CSAR irradiance measurements.

## 1.5 Agreement of Procedures

Based on the eleventh session of the Commission for Instruments and Methods of Observation (CIMO-11), resolution 1, on the evaluation of calibration factors resulting from international pyrheliometer comparisons, an ad-hoc working group has been established at IPC-XIII. The ad-hoc working group met several times during the comparisons to discuss preliminary results, evaluate the performance of the World Radiometric Reference (WRR) and recommend the updating of the calibration factors of the participating instruments. The group approved the procedure to compute the new WRR factors of the WSG as well as the calibration factors of the participating instruments. In addition, the group discussed and recommended the future of IPCs and RPCs. The ad-hoc group was chaired by Stefan Wacker, (Germany, RA VI) and composed as follows: Khaled Wael (Egypt, RA I), Nozomu Ohkawara and Shun Sasaki(Japan, RA II), Edgardo Sepúlvedo (Chile, RA III), Adriana Elizabeth Gonzalez (Mexico, RA IV), Michael Milner (Australia, RA V), Thomas Carlund (Sweden, RA VI), Ibrahim Reda and Tom Kirk (USA), Bruce Forgan (Austalia, vice president of INFCOM), Wolfgang Finsterle (PMOD/WRC). Dirk Fehse (PTB, Germany) and Markus Suter (Davos Instruments AG) participated as observers in some meetings of the ad-hoc group.

The procedures used to compute the new WRR factors of the WSG and participating instruments are explained in Section 2.3.

## Chapter 2 Irradiance Measurements and Results

Measurements were taken on 11 days (2021 September 27, 28, 30, October 1, 2, 8 - 11, 14, 15). Up to 17 series of 21 minutes duration were acquired during the sunniest days of the intercomparison. In total 141 series were acquired. The best observing conditions were experienced from October 8 - 14. Therefore, only the measurements from those days were used to transfer the WRR and to determine the new WRR factors for the WSG. Restricting the WSG evaluation to the best observing conditions not only reduces the scatter in the WRR factors of the WSG, but also avoids the first couple of days, when CROM2L experienced problems with the mechanical shutter, thus allowing for a consistent statistical representation of the all valid WSG instruments in the new WRR. All measurement days were accepted to calculate the WRR factors of participating pyrheliometers. Applying the same restriction as for the WSG seems unreasonable and would result in very few data points for some of the participating pyrheliometers. The following data selection criteria were applied, according the recommendation by the ad-hoc group, resulting in 1441 valid irradiance readings for the WRR.

### 2.1 Data Selection Criteria for the Final Evaluation

The Ad-hoc Group responsible for the approval of the final evaluation procedure (c.f. Sect. 1.5) agreed on the following criteria for the acceptance of IPC-XIII data:

- 1. That no measurements be used for the absolute cavity radiometers (field of view = 5 degrees) if a cloud is within 8 degrees of the sun. A thermal imager will facilitate the detection of clouds near the sun.
- 2. The irradiance as measured by PMO2 must exceed  $700 \ \mathrm{Wm^{-2}}$ .
- 3. That no measurements be used if the wind speed is greater than  $2.5 \text{ ms}^{-1}$ .
- 4. That no data be used if the 500 nm AOD is greater than 0.120.
- 5. That an individual point be excluded from the series if the standard deviation of the solar irradiance in a 1-second period is greater than  $1 \text{ Wm}^{-2}$  (based on the 6 fast readings by PMO2).
- 6. That an individual point be excluded if it is not in a contiguous stretch of 6 valid points.
- 7. That the minimum number of acceptable data points be 150 for the PMO2 taken over a minimum of three days during the comparison period.

## 2.2 Status of the WSG and Transfer of the WRR

The main objective of the periodic IPCs is the dissemination of the World Radiometric Reference (WRR) in order to ensure worldwide homogeneity of solar radiation measurements. The WRR is realized by the World Standard Group (WSG) at PMOD/WRC, which is frequently inter-compared to detect possible deviations of individual WSG-radiometers with respect to the group average and to ensure the stability of the WRR. In addition to this *internal* stability check the stability of the WRR is assessed during IPCs by comparing the WSG to other pyrheliometers that have participated in previous IPCs.

Since IPC-XII, which was held in 2015 [7], only one member instruments of the WSG has failed in internal stability check. The instrument PMO5 slowly drifted with respect to the WSG average during the last inter-IPC period. A reason for the drift could not be determined. It was therefore not considered for the calculation of the new WRR but will hopefully help to transfer the WRR to the next IPC. Starting on June 6, 2017, PAC3 was suddenly reading  $\sim 0.4\%$  low because of an insect in the cavity. The readings returned to the normal level after the insect was removed on August 11, 2021. PAC3 was not considered for calculating the WRR during the affected period.

The remaining four WSG instruments (PMO2, HF18748, MK67814, CROM2L) did not show any irregularities and are thus considered stable over the past five years<sup>1</sup>. The new WRR is calculated based on the average readings of these five radiometers.

## 2.3 Computation of the New WRR Factors

#### 2.3.1 WSG Instruments

The WRR factor  $WRR_{i,IPC}$  for the WSG instrument  $i, i \in \{PMO2, CROM2L, MK67814, HF18748, PAC3, PMO5\}$ , by definition is the ratio of the WRR to the WSG instrument i averaged over the selected days during the IPC (October 8 to 14, see top of page 15):

$$WRR_{i,IPC} = \left\langle \frac{WRR(t)}{WSG_i(t)} \right\rangle_t,$$

where WRR(t) is the reference irradiance and  $WSG_i(t)$  irradiance measured by WSG instrument iat the time t, and  $\langle x(t) \rangle_t$  denotes the temporal average of x(t). The reference irradiance (WRR) is defined as the mean value of the simultaneous readings of at least four WSG instruments, multiplied by their corresponding WRR factors from the previous IPC. Because the ratios of PMO5 with respect to the WRR was unstable during the past five years it was not used to compute the reference irradiance during IPC-XIII. A new WRR factor was determined for PMO5 and it will be considered to transfer the WRR for the coming inter-IPC period. With  $j \in \{PMO2, CROM2L, PAC3, HF19748, MK67814\}$ we calculate the reference irradiance as

$$WRR(t) = \langle WSG_j(t) * WRR_{j, \mathsf{IPC}-\mathsf{XII}} \rangle_j.$$

We thus get

$$WRR_{i,\mathsf{IPC-XIII}} = \left\langle \frac{\langle WSG_j(t) * WRR_{j,\mathsf{IPC-XII}} \rangle_j}{WSG_i(t)} \right\rangle_t,$$

where  $i \in \{PMO2, CROM2L, MK67814, HF18748, PAC3, PMO5\}$  and  $j \in \{PMO2, CROM2L, PAC3, HF18748, MK67814\}$ .

#### 2.3.2 Participating Instruments

For each participating instrument k the new WRR factor is calculated according to

$$WRR_{k,\mathsf{IPC-XIII}} = \left\langle \frac{WRR(t)}{Irr_k(t)} \right\rangle_t,$$

where  $Irr_k(t)$  is the irradiance measured by the instrument k at the time t and WRR(t) the reference irradiance at time t.

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$ CROM2L did experience problems with the mechanical shutter, which could be fixed with kind support from the manufacturer (IRMB).

Instrument	WRR factor	WRR Factor	standard	# of	Relative Change
	IPC-XII	IPC-XIII	uncertainty	points	of WRR Factor
			$rac{\sigma}{\sqrt{N-1}}$ [ppm]	N	[ppm]
PMO2	0.998189	0.998477	25	628	289
PMO5	0.999395	1.000595	35	337	1201
CROM2L	1.003118	1.003431	29	336	312
MK67814	1.001702	1.002200	18	628	497
PAC3	1.002190	1.001741	15	623	-448
HF18748	0.998258	0.997719	16	629	-540

Table 2.1: New WRR-factors for the WSG instruments computed using PMO2, HF18748, MK67814, CROM2L, and PAC3.

Temporal averaging is done by fitting a gaussian to the distribution of WRR-to-instrument ratios. The largest outliers are successively removed until a  $\chi^2$  test confirms the hypothesis that the measured WRR-to-instrument ratios follow a normal distribution with 10% significance, or until all ratios are within  $\pm 0.002$  of their arithmetic mean value. The new WRR factors for the WSG and all participating instruments are listed in Table 2.2.

Table 2.2: The new WRR factors for the participating instruments

Instrument	<i>C</i> <sub>1</sub>	$C_2$	$R_n$	WRR	σ	Ν	Country/ Owner
			Ω	Factor	ppm		
AHF0000	2.0355			1.003171	760	802	JRC Italy
AHF14915	20010	0.065	10	0.999827	971	848	Eppley USA
AHF23734	2.002			0.998671	763	1080	NREL USA
AHF27159	20030			0.999429	791	973	KNMI The Nether-
							lands
AHF27798	20020	0.066	10	1.001000	1972	691	Eppley USA
AHF28486	2.001	0.066	10	0.999378	1447	1004	CIEMAT Spain
AHF28560	2.0028			1.000298	1040	793	ISO-Cal North
							America USA
AHF28968	19980.2			0.998019	714	1066	ARM/SGP USA
AHF29220	19999			0.997793	696	1060	NREL USA
AHF29221	20000			1.001690	740	634	Germany
AHF29221-W	20000			1.069136	871	313	Germany
AHF29223	19998			0.999456	642	739	Mexico
AHF29225	20004.2			0.996624	1020	791	Algeria
AHF30110	1.9999			1.072222	6718	914	KACARE Saudi
							Arabia
AHF30713	19989			0.997596	668	1058	NREL USA
AHF31103	19989	0.066	10000	1.007017	4053	373	Egypt
AHF31110	19989			0.997137	581	719	United Kingdom of
							Great Britain and
							Northern Ireland
AHF32449	200592	0.066	10	0.997746	811	856	Eppley USA
AHF32455	20009.2			1.001471	751	1140	WRC

Instrument	$C_1$	$C_2$	$R_n$	WRR	$\sigma$	Ν	Country/ Owner
	-	-	$\hat{\Omega}$	Factor	ppm		57
AHF33396	1.9988			0.997946	1338	807	AIST Japan
AHF34926	1			1.001361	784	687	UO USA
AHF37812	19903	0.066	10	1.001411	1020	846	KIER Korea
AHF37813	1.9979			1.000846	668	873	United Kingdom of
							Great Britain and
							Northern Ireland
AHF37814	2.013			1.001447	636	986	Slovakia
AHF37816	1.9998			0.999522	797	780	ISO-Cal North
							America USA
AWX33393	2.0009	0.066	10	1.001048	845	917	Sweden
CH1-040370	10.48			1.002201	1760	884	JRC Italy
CH1-060460	10.07			1.001348	1773	897	JRC Italy
CH1-930018	10.85			1.000590	2458	907	JRC Italy
CHP1-110533	7.8			0.995962	2463	891	JRC Italy
CHP1-131107	7.6874			0.998671	2427	793	Libya
CHP1-140049	8.27			0.995478	734	833	Slovenia
CHP1-150261	8.29			0.987260	2762	778	LES Uruguay
CHP1-200837	9.32			1.014874	5658	1053	KNMI The Nether-
							lands
CHP1-200838	8.7			1.007458	1412	1023	KNMI The Nether-
							lands
CHP1-REF2	7.94			1.005724	1424	604	Kipp&Zonen The
							Netherlands
CP20C-101	1			0.061661	2535	497	Hukseflux The
CD00C 100				0.061000		465	Netherlands
CP20C-102	L			0.061228	2382	465	Hukseflux The
	1			0.061605	1564	404	
CF200-101	L L			0.001095	1504	494	Netherlands
CP2011-102	1			0 061344	1384	461	Hukseflux The
	-			0.001344	1004	401	Netherlands
CR05L	1			0.998807	1712	382	Belgium
CR09L	1			1.001980	1832	381	Belgium
CSAR	1			1.003115	1302	64	WRC
DR02-9210	10.739			1.001386	1707	659	Hukseflux The
	201100				1.0.		Netherlands
DR20-65033	21.70166			0.982803	1223	645	Hukseflux The
							Netherlands
DR30-65005	17.968			0.999679	1381	652	Hukseflux The
							Netherlands
EPAC11402	10024			1.006732	3074	747	WRC
HF15744	20020			0.998696	805	783	RISE Sweden
HF27157	20037.6			0.996712	887	749	Germany
HF30497	19943.8			1.000001	657	1019	Czech Republic
IRS04-2101	1			1.001449	1234	695	AIST Japan
IRS04-2102	1			1.001043	1573	703	Ishikawa Japan

Table 2.2. (Continued)	Table 2.2:	(continued)
------------------------	------------	-------------

Instrument	$C_1$	$\mathcal{C}_2$	$R_n$	WRR	$\sigma$	Ν	Country/ Owner	
			Ω	Factor	ppm			
MS56-12036	7.3			0.972244	3064	906	JRC Italy	
MS56-12039	7.08			0.994387	2782	904	JRC Italy	
MS56-P12023	1			1.021953	1980	1151	EKO Japan	
MS57-1702504	7.36			1.001764	4271	912	JRC Italy	
NIP-21451E6	8.42			1.003161	4070	916	JRC Italy	
NIP-23927E6	8.54			0.998800	6748	918	JRC Italy	
NIP-25738E6	7.92			0.994990	6147	919	JRC Italy	
NIP-26626E6	8.24			0.994483	4821	916	JRC Italy	
NIP-31144E6	8.04			0.993855	5722	1205	WRC	
PH1-999991	1			0.997332	3176	504	Kipp&Zonen The Netherlands	
PMO6-0103	51183.3			0.998913	609	611	Kipp&Zonen The Netherlands	
PMO6-0301	51161.5			1.000435	988	976	CIEMAT Spain	
PMO6-0304	50000			1.023841	614	572	WRC	
PMO6-0401	50000			1.021649	702	1072	WRC	
PMO6-0405	50936			0.999130	693	911	Germany	
PMO6-0803	51221			1.000287	568	597	WRC	
PMO6-0808	50479			0.999958	465	393	China	
PMO6-0816	51037			0.999191	1260	575	EKO Japan	
PMO6-0817	51141			0.999957	762	941	Russian Federation	
PMO6-1102	51295.5			0.999367	802	777	Mexico	
PMO6-1103	51396.9			0.999661	557	596	Slovenia	
PMO6-1104	51231.9			1.000427	881	580	PTB Germany	
PMO6-1104-L	51231.89			0.999903	1058	408	PTB Germany	
PMO6-1109	51250.1			0.999154	601	579	Croatia	
PMO6-1602	50925			1.003889	716	731	USACH Chile	
PMO6-1603	51178			0.999802	568	584	Japan	
PMO6-1609	51110			1.000318	747	621	CIEMAT Spain	
PMO6-1609-L	51110			1.000538	748	236	CIEMAT Spain	
PMO6-1610	50997			0.999805	482	500	Indonesia	
PMO6-1611	50917			1.003372	669	1066	Davos Instruments Switzerland	
PMO6-5	50894			0.999562	890	959	Germany	
PMO6-7	132.79			0.999504	2335	339	Switzerland	
PMO6-79-122	600			1.002051	2647	637	WRC	
PMO6-81109	600.0345			0.998599	706	872	JRC Italy	
PMO6-911204	601.7356			1.000612	871	862	JRC Italy	
PMO8-F201-001	51851.1			0.999959	757	878	PTB Germany	
PMO8-F201-002	51806			1.000068	765	932	PTB Germany	
PMO8-F201-006A	51510			1.000082	702	947	Sweden	
PMO8-F201-007A	51400			1.006331	721	877	WRC	
PMO8-F201-009	51809			0.999853	663	981	Argentina	

Table 2.2: (continued)

Instrument	$C_1$	$C_2$	$R_n$	WRR	$\sigma$	Ν	Country/ Owner
			Ω	Factor	ppm		
PMO8-F211-001	51588			0.999772	688	859	Davos Instruments
							Switzerland
PMO8-F211-002	51892			1.000106	743	931	Davos Instruments
							Switzerland
SHP1-130042	7.85467			0.988180	1358	2967	PTB Germany
SHP1-175109	9.07728			0.995921	1394	2969	PTB Germany
SHP1-175110	9.05247			0.998466	1326	2962	PTB Germany
SHP1-185163	8.91			1.000623	1307	1876	DTU Denmark
SHP1-195181	9.9011			0.999353	1397	1618	USACH Chile
SHP1-205241	9.14			1.010177	823	1857	DTU Denmark
SHP33-01	6.53			1.004188 1877 815 Kipp&Zoner		Kipp&Zonen The	
							Netherlands
SIAR-2A	1			0.990934	2617	43	WRC
SNIP-37886E6	8.556			0.997286	1360	781	CIEMAT Spain
TMI67604	1.0052			0.999402	937	842	JRC Italy
TMI68018	1.0046			0.996851	738	1108	NREL USA
TMI68835	1.00383			1.000427	1319	882	JRC Italy

Table 2.2: (continued)

## 2.4 External stability check of the WSG

In Section 2.2 the stability of the WSG was checked by analyzing the trends of individual members of the WSG with respect to the group's average. Here we present an external assessment of the stability of the WSG with respect to all cavity radiometers which have participated in at least two consecutive IPCs since 1980 (c.f. Fig. 2.1). This analysis confirms the long-term stability of the WSG within the required uncertainty level of 3000 ppm (0.3%). Compared to IPC-XII [7] the WRR factors of 38 cavity radiometers have changed by 650 ppm on average, with a statistical uncertainty of 707 ppm (2- $\sigma$ ). We thus conclude that the WSG has not significantly drifted over the past five years. For completeness the history of WRR factors since 1980 (IPC-V) is given in Table 2.3 for all participating instruments. Note that in this table the actual WRR factors are listed while normalized factors (with respect to C<sub>1</sub>) were used for assessing the stability of the WSG. Normalization was necessary because some instruments changed their calibration factors C<sub>1</sub>, which produces spurious changes in their WRR factors.

Table 2.3: The history of WRR factors. In this table the actual WRR factors are listed. They depend on the calibration constant C<sub>1</sub> which was used and which may have changed over time. In the WSG-stability analysis presented in Section 2.4 and Figure 2.1 these factors were re-normalized accordingly. Note that only pyrheliometers which have participated in more than one IPC are listed here.

Instrument	IPC-V	IPC-VI	IPC-VII	IPC-VIII	IPC-IX	IPC-X	IPC-XI	IPC-XII	IPC-XIII
A7	1.02210	1.00011	1.00109	1.00160					
A24	1.02323	0.99896							
A171	1.00903	0.99843	1.00042	0.99967	1.003				
A212	1.01912	0.99932	1.00154	1.00175	1.00065	1.003381	0.996482		
A507	1.02143	0.99964							
A561	1.02572	0.99770							
A564	1.02415	0.99908	1.00190	0.99655					
A567					0.99914	1.000240			
A568	1.02732	0.99823	1.00099						
A576	1.020130	1.005233	1.001071	1.000460	0.997370	1.000050	0.990369	0.990848	
A578	1.02538	0.99941	1.00225	1.00171	1.00571				
A583	1.00096	1.00202							
A702				1.0291	1.00394	1.005965	0.998769		
A708	1.03027	1.00396							
A7190	1.02029		1.00419	1.00092					
A7636	1.02381	0.99987	1.00151	1.00163	1.001121				
A9003	1.00122	0.99278	0.99978						
A12578				1.04137	1.00599	1.006532	1.00858		
A13439				1.022990	1.002370	1.003291	1.001350	1.0034568	
A15192			0.99913	1.00189	1.00157	1.002165		1.0304138	
A16491			0.99571	0.99644					
A18020		0.99870				1.004923	1.00265		
A18587		1.00524	1.00505	1.00605	1.0021	0.997646			
AHF00000							0.997352	1.000307	1.003171
AHF14915	0.998751	0.998421	0.999980	1.000460	1.000260	0.999640	0.999682	0.999542	0.999827
AHF17142	0.998801	0.997733	0.998901	0.998860	0.998930	0.999141	0.998358	0.997946	
AHF18742						1.003773	1.002280	1.004506	

Instrument	IPC-V	IPC-VI	IPC-VII	IPC-VIII	IPC-IX	IPC-X	IPC-XI	IPC-XII	IPC-XIII
AHF23734							0.998281	0.998187	0.998671
AHF27159			0.999271	0.998880		0.998004	1.000020	0.999438	
AHF27160			0.997267	0.997090	0.996770	0.996910	0.996467	0.997424	
AHF27798			0.998363	0.998980	0.999880	0.999410	0.999018	0.998654	1.001000
AHF28486							0.997308	0.997318	0.999378
AHF28553				0.997560	0.997330	0.996105	0.996842	0.997739	
AHF28560								0.999283	1.000298
AHF28968				0.998720	0.998660	0.997765	0.997734	0.997627	0.998019
AHF29220				0.998620	0.998460	0.997556	0.997691	0.997482	0.997793
AHF29223				0.997450	0.997470	0.996761	0.997352	1.003219	0.999456
AHF29225					0.99709	0.996105	0.996896		0.996624
AHF30110-W								1.063471	1.072222
AHF30497					0.997740	0.999350	0.999623	0.999589	
AHF30713					0.998610	0.997512	0.997548	0.997228	0.997596
AHF31041					0.998130	0.996294	0.996286	0.996392	
AHF31103					0.998990	0.999640		0.999345	1.007017
AHF31105						1.001649	0.999964	0.998656	
AHF31110					0.997890	0.997211	0.996431	0.997038	0.997137
AHF31117							0.998861	0.999042	
AHF32455						0.999090	1.000280	1.001380	1.001471
AHF33396						0.997951	0.998079	0.997184	0.997946
AHF36011							0.998226 <sup>2</sup>	1.000005	
AHF36013							1.058110	0.999802	
AHF37813								1.000461	1.000846
AHF37814								1.001054	1.001447
AHF37816								0.999458	0.999522
AWX31114							1.001240	1.001209	
AWX32448					1.00031	0.999874	0.999939	0.999986	
AWX33393						0.997281	0.999362	0.999885	1.001048
CH1-040370								0.998163	1.002201
CH1-050392							1.000250	1.010940	
CH1-020283							0.997677	0.993818	
CH1-060460							1.002330	1.004743	1.001348
CH1-930018							1.000750	1.001243	1.000590
CH1-940072						1.005958	1.007580	1.0093218	
CHP1-100245							1.000490	1.0011568	
CHP1-110533								0.998562	0.995962
CHP1-REF2								1.004987	1.005724
CR09R					0.999123	0.999111	0.998363		
CSAR							0.992123	1.002100	1.003115
EPAC11402					0.999250	1.000560	1.000680	1.0362658	1.006732
HF15744	1.000640	1.000030	0.999650	0.999470	0.999160	0.998034	0.998085	0.9982018	0.998696

#### Table 2.3: (continued)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>This WRR factor results from a re-evaluation of the IPC-XI data after excluding all measurements from October  $3^{rd}$  and  $7^{th}$ , 2010, because a wrong calibration factor was used on those days. The IPC-XI report erroneously included the affected data and states a WRR factor of 0.996933.

Instrument	IPC-V	IPC-VI	IPC-VII	IPC-VIII	IPC-IX	IPC-X	IPC-XI	IPC-XII	IPC-XIII
HF19746	0.999520	0.999940	1.001603	0.999190	0.999660	0.998782	0.998886	1.000022	
HF27157				1.000380	0.999020	0.998722	0.999647	0.999084	0.999429
HF27162			1.000370	1.000960	1.000820	1.000180	0.999212	0.999543	
HF27796					0.996910	0.996979	0.997204	0.996033	
MAR-1-3				0.999610			0.999991	0.999953	
NIP-21451E6							0.999193	1.005957	1.003161
NIP-23927E6								1.000885	0.998800
NIP-25738E6							0.998843	0.991889	0.994990
NIP-26626E6								1.000334	0.994483
NIP-31144E6							0.997184	0.9968248	0.993855
PMO6-5	1.006756	1.000100	0.998602	0.997980	1.000530	0.999960	0.999116	0.998288	0.999562
PM06-7								0.999681	0.999504
PMO6-79-122			0.996890	0.999970	0.999860	1.000390	0.999401	1.000051	1.002051
PMO6-80022		1.000230	0.996890	0.996130	0.996990	0.997944	1.003080	0.997891	
PMO6-811108		0.999210	0.999970	1.000110	0.999970	0.998114	1.000660	1.000083	
PMO6-81109					0.999460	0.998412	0.998577	0.998315	0.998599
PMO6-850405				1.000370	0.999290	0.999191	1.000560	0.998919	
PMO6-850406					1.000320	0.999440	1.000200	1.001992	
PMO6-850410				1.001800	1.015280	0.987030	0.990890	0.990976	
PMO6-911204					1.000810	0.999011	0.999711	0.999445	1.000612
PMO6-0103						0.999424		0.997916	0.998913
PMO6-0301							1.000588	1.000183	1.000435
PMO6-0401							1.021527	1.020979	1.021649
PMO6-0403							1.000160	0.999753	
PMO6-0405							0.999684	0.999265	0.999130
PMO6-0803							1.000364	1.000335	1.000287
PMO6-0804							0.999914	0.999908	
PMO6-0808								0.999421	0.999958
PMO6-0817								0.999516	0.999957
PMO6-1102								0.999389	0.999367
PMO6-1104								1.000194	1.000427
PMO6-1109								0.998732	0.999154
SIAR-2A						1.000623	0.991696	0.991360	0.990934
SIAR-2B						0.998620	1.000290	1.000895	
SIAR-2C						1.000087	0.999839	0.998949	
TMI67502	0.999290	0.998471	1.000390	0.998660	0.999660	0.999480	0.999294	1.000999	
TMI67604	1.00238	1.00093	1.000140	1.00239	0.99928	0.998792	0.998226		0.999402
TMI68018			0.998692		0.998480	0.997138	0.996804	0.996601	0.996851
TMI68025			0.999460	0.999860	1.000060	0.998135	0.998613	0.998133	
TMI68835							1.000980	1.000723	1.000427

#### Table 2.3: (continued)



Figure 2.1: The historic evolution of the WRR factors of all cavity radiometers which have participated in at least two consecutive IPC's since 1980 (IPC-V). Note that in this analysis all WRR factors are normalized to the calibration constant C<sub>1</sub> which was used at the time. The thick magenta line is the average of all plotted data points. The most recent data point was calculated from 38 open cavity pyrheliometers that have participated in IPC-XII and IPC-XIII. In this metric the drift of the WRR between IPC-XII (2015) [7] and IPC-XIII (2021) was  $650 \pm 540 \text{ ppm}$  (k = 2). The cumulated drift since IPC-V (1980) is  $-210 \pm 2400 \text{ ppm}$  (k = 2) shown by the semi-transparent dashed magenta line.

## Chapter 3 Conclusions and Recommendations

The WRR is considered stable within the limits required by the Guide to Instruments and Methods of Observation (WMO-No. 8). The new WRR factors are calculated based on the average readings of PMO2, HF18478, MK67814, CROM2L, and PAC3.

## 3.1 Graphical Representation of the Results

On the following pages are the data plots for each instrument. The deviation from WRR is plotted. All the points which were used for the analysis (i.e. the points fulfilling the selection criteria listed in Sect. 2.1) have been plotted with a corresponding histogram on the side.



26
































































0.990

0.990









# Chapter 4 Auxiliary Data

The wind speed and AOD measurements were used for selecting valid data points (cf. Sect. 2.1). Meteorological parameters and irradiance levels are plotted for reference only.



## 4.1 Direct and Diffuse Irradiance

Direct (WRR) and diffuse irradiance (shaded K&Z CM22 S/N 020059).



## 4.2 Airmass and Aerosol Optical Depth (AOD)

A four-channel Precision Filter Radiometer (PFR) was used to determine AOD.

### 4.3 Wind Speed



The wind speed and direction above the WSG tracker.



### 4.4 Meteorological Data

Meteorological parameters measured by the SwissMetNet Davos station of MeteoSwiss (adjacent to IPC-XIII measuring field).
## Chapter 5 Symposium

## 5.1 To Build and Share Knowledge

On cloudy, overcast, or rainy days when no measurements were possible the IPC-XIII symposium was held. Radiation experts from PMOD/WRC as well as many IPC-XIII participants presented their work and/or national radiation infrastructure in order to share and build knowledge.

All presentations are publicly accessable on https://community.wmo.int/publications-and-iom-reports/ipc-xiii-proceedings [8].

## 6.1 Addresses of Participants

AlAdwani Abdullah King Abdullah City for Atomic And Renewable Energy Saudi Arabia - Riyadh 2022 Riyadh Saudi Arabia email: a.adwani@energy.gov.sa

Amand Julien RMIB Av. Circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: julien.amand@meteo.be

Andreas Afshin National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL) 15013 Denver West Parkway 80401 Golden USA email: afshin.andreas@nrel.gov

Büchel Valeria Davos Instruments AG Am Kurpark 3 7270 Davos Platz Switzerland email: valeria.buechel@davos-instruments.ch

Barreto Africa Izaña Atmospheric Research Center (AEMET) Calle La Marina no 20 38001 Santa Cruz de Tenerife Spain email: abarretov@aemet.es phone: 0034 922151718

BinDayil Abdulhakim King Abdullah City for Atomic And Renewable Energy Saudi Arabia - Riyadh 2022 Riyadh Saudi Arabia email: a.bindayil@energy.gov.sa AlQahtani Saad King Abdullah City for Atomic And Renewable Energy Saudi Arabia - Riyadh 2022 Riyadh Saudi Arabia email: s.qahtani@energy.gov.sa phone: 966507441114

Andersson Anne RISE Research Institute of Sweden Brinellgatan 4, Box 857 50115 Borås Sweden email: anne.andersson@ri.se phone: '+46703749944

BEN MOHAMMED MOHAMED ELOUALID Office National de la METEOROLOGIE P.O BOX 31 METEO Tamanrasset 11000 ALGERIA 11000 TAMANRASSET ALGERIA email: dmrstam11@gmail.com phone: 213667429778

Balenzategui Jose CIEMAT Avenida Complutense, 40 28040 MADRID Spain email: jl.balenzategui@ciemat.es phone: '+34 91 496 2509

Becker Ralf Deutscher Wetterdienst / Meteorologisches Observatorium Lindenberg (DWD/MOL-RAO) Am Observatorium 12 15248 Tauche, OT: Lindenberg Germany email: ralf.becker@dwd.de

Buchli Jon Davos Instruments AG Am Kurpark 3 7270 Davos Platz Switzerland email: jon.buchli@davos-instruments.ch

#### Addresses of Participants

Carlund Thomas Swedish Meteorological and Hydrological Institute (SMHI) Folkborgsvägen 17 60176 Norrköping Sweden email: thomas.carlund@smhi.se phone: '+46114958229

Conscience Christian RMIB Av. Circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: cch@meteo.be

Donkers Chiel Hukseflux Thermal Sensors B.V. Delftechpark 31 2628XJ Delft The Netherlands email: chiel@hukseflux.com

Essnid Akram Libyan Center for Solar Energy Research and Studies Sidi Abdulkareem St, Tajora, Tripoli, Libya 218 Tripoli Libya email: sneeda74@yahoo.com phone: 218918998566

Galleano Roberto 3, Via Santorre die Santarosa 10064 Pinerolo Italy email: roberto.galleano@protonmail.com phone: +39 3333225876

Gotseff Peter National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL) 15013 Denver West Parkway 80401 Golden USA email: Peter.Gotseff@nrel.gov

Hiscock David Met Office Met Office, FitzRoy Road EX1 3PB Exeter UK email: david.hiscock@metoffice.gov.uk Chevalier André RMIB (part-2) Av circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: andy@meteo.be

Cordero Raúl Universidad de Santiago de Chile Av. Libertador Bernardo O'Higgins 3363 9170022 Santiago Chile email: raul.cordero@usach.cl

Doppler Lionel Deutscher Wetterdienst / Meteorologisches Observatorium Lindenberg (DWD/MOL-RAO) Am Observatorium 12 15248 Tauche, OT: Lindenberg Germany email: lionel.doppler@dwd.de

Friedrich Dirk Physikalisch-Technische Bundesanstalt Bundesallee 100 38116 Braunschweig Deutschland email: dirk.friedrich@ptb.de phone: 495315924141

Gonzalez Adriana Elizabeth Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México Av. Universidad 3000 4510 Mexico City Mexico email: gonzalezc@igeofisica.unam.mx phone: +52 5556224139

Hendriks Hendrik KNMI PO Box 201 3730 AE De Bilt Netherlands email: izzy.hendriks@knmi.nl

Hoogendijk Kees EKO Instruments Europe B.V. Lulofsstraat 55, u28 2521 AL Den Haag Netherlands email: kees.hoogendijk@eko-eu.com

#### Supplementary Information

Iakovlev Vladislav Voeikov Main Geophysical Observatory (Voeikov MGO) Karbysheva st. 7 194021 St. Petersburg Russian Federation email: vadosprod@gmail.com

Jorquera José Universidad de Santiago de Chile Av. Libertador Bernardo O'Higgins 3363 Santiago Chile email: jorqueratorres@gmail.com

Kalantan Abdullah King Abdullah City for Atomic And Renewable Energy Saudi Arabia - Riyadh 2022 Riyadh Saudi Arabia email: s.qahtani@energy.gov.sa

Kirk Tom The Eppley Laboratory, Inc. 12 Sheffield Avenue 2871 Newport United States email: info@eppleylab.com phone: 4018471020

Konings Jörgen Hukseflux Thermal Sensors B.V. Delftechpark 31 2628XJ Delft The Netherlands email: jorgen@hukseflux.com

Lindgren Mikael RISE Research Institute of Sweden Brinellgatan 4, Box 857 50115 Borås Sweden email: mikael.lindgren@ri.se Jensen Adam Technical University of Denmark, Kgs. Lyngby Brovej, building 118 2800 Kgs. Lyngby Denmark email: arajen@byg.dtu.dk phone: +4552747411

Källberg Stefan RISE Research Institute of Sweden Brinellgatan 4, Box 857 50115 Borås Sweden email: stefan.kallberg@ri.se

Khaled Wael Egyptian Meteorological Authority (EMA) El Khalifa El Maamoun Street - Kobri El kobba 11321 Cairo Egypt email: wael.khaled@gmail.com phone: +201006072166

Knap Wouter KNMI PO Box 201 3730 AE De Bilt Netherlands email: wouter.knap@knmi.nl phone: +31646254013

Laguarda Agustín Laboratorio de Energía Solar, Universidad de la República. Av. Luis Batlle Berres km 508 (ex-Ruta 3), Salto Grande 50000 Salto Uruguay email: agu.laguarda@gmail.com phone: +59899123346

Müllejans Harald European Commission - DG JRC - Directorate C -Energy, Transport and Climate Building 45, TP450 , Via Fermi, 2749 I-21027 Ispra (Va) ITALY email: harald.muellejans@ec.europa.eu Malcorps Pierre RMIB (part-2) Av circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: pierre.malcorps@meteo.be

Mes Joop Kipp & Zonen (Ott hydromet) Delftechpark 36 2628XH Delft The Netherlands email: joop.mes@otthydromet.com phone: +31-628638174

Molema Tijmen KNMI PO Box 201 3730 AE De Bilt Netherlands email: tijmen.molema@knmi.nl

Naranen Erik ISO-Cal North America 36610 N 20th Street Arizona, 85086 Phoenix United States email: enaranen@isocalnorthamerica.com phone: 001+623-693-2153

Nevens Stijn RMIB Av. Circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: stijn.nevens@meteo.be phone: +32 (0) 485 50 38 44

Pó Mário EKO Lulofsstraat 55, unit 28 2521 AL The Hague Netherlands email: mario.po@eko-instruments.com phone: +31628838831 McGee Major ATLAS Material Testing Technology LLC 45601 North 47th Ave., 85087-7042 Phoenix United States email: major.mcgee@ametek.com phone: 1 (843) 230-7802

Miklavžina Iztok Slovenian Environment Agency Vojkova 1b 1000 Ljubljana Slovenia email: iztok.miklavzina@gov.si

Nagel Erik Kipp & Zonen (Ott hydromet) Delftechpark 36 2628XH Delft The Netherlands email: erik.nagel@otthydromet.com

Nelson Donald Eppley Laboratory 6136 Misty Way, Longmont CO 80503, United States 80503 Longmont United States email: donaldnelson@mac.com phone: 1 3037750443

Ohkubo Kazuhiko ISHIKAWA TRADING CO., LTD. 4-6-10 Shinkawa 181-0004 Mitaka-shi Japan email: ohkubo@ishikawa-sangyo.co.jp

Pavanello Diego European Commission - DG JRC - Directorate C -Energy, Transport and Climate Building 45, TP450 , Via Fermi, 2749 I-21027 Ispra (Va) ITALY email: diego.pavanello@ec.europa.eu

#### Supplementary Information

Peterson Josh University of Oregon, Solar Radiation Monitoring Lab 361 Onyx Bridge, Department of Physics 97403 Eugene United States email: jpeters4@uoregon.edu phone: 5413464745

Premec Krunoslav WMO 7bis, avenue de la Paix CH-1211 Geneva Switzerland email: kpremec@wmo.int

Rüedi Isabelle WMO 7bis, Avenue de la Paix 1211 Geneva 2 Switzerland email: iruedi@wmo.int phone: +41 22 730 82 78

Reda Ibrahim National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL) 15013 Denver West Parkway 80401 Golden USA email: Ibrahim.Reda@nrel.gov phone: 13033846385

Rodionov Artem Voeikov Main Geophysical Observatory (Voeikov MGO) Karbysheva st. 7 194021 St. Petersburg Russian Federation email: rodionov.artm@gmail.com phone: 7 952 237 48 30

Sanghera Sandeep Met Office Met Office, FitzRoy Road EX1 3PB Exeter UK email: sandeep.sanghera@metoffice.gov.uk phone: +44 (0)7525387627 Pokorny Jiri Czech Hydrometeorological Institute Zamecek 456 500 08 Hradec Kralove Czech Republic email: jiri.pokorny@chmi.cz phone: +420 495 279 261

Pribullová Anna Slovak Hydrometeorological Institute Aerological and solar radiation measurement centre SHMU 058 01 Poprad-Ganovce 178 Slovakia email: apribull@ta3.sk phone: +421908635343

Rea Anthony WMO 7bis, Avenue de la Paix 1211 Geneva 2 Switzerland email: area@wmo.int

Riveros-Rosas David Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico Av Universidad 3000 4510 Coyoacán Mexico email: driveros@igeofisica.unam.mx phone: +52 (55) 23409797

Russo Paola UdelaR Phisics Department, Solar Energy Laboratory, Av. Luis Batlle Berres km 508 (ex-Ruta 3), Salto Grande 50000 Salto Uruguay email: paolarussoganon@gmail.com phone: +59899112041

Schifano Luca RMIB Av. Circulaire 3 1180 Brussels Belgium email: Luca.schifano@meteo.be Sepúlveda Edgardo Universidad de Santiago de Chile Av. Libertador Bernardo O'Higgins 3363 9170022 Santiago Chile email: edgardo.sepulvedaa@usach.cl phone: +56977690532

Svetličič Marko Slovenian Environment Agency Vojkova 1b 1000 Ljubljana Slovenia email: marko.svetlicic@gov.si phone: +386 1 478 44 64

Wacker Stefan Deutscher Wetterdienst / Meteorologisches Observatorium Lindenberg (DWD/MOL-RAO) Am Observatorium 12 15248 Tauche, OT: Lindenberg Germany email: stefan.wacker@dwd.de phone: +49680625860

Zaaiman Willem European Commission - DG JRC - Directorate C -Energy, Transport and Climate Building 45, TP450 , Via Fermi, 2749 I-21027 Ispra (Va) ITALY email: willem.zaaiman@ec.europa.eu phone: +39 0332 785750 Suter Markus Davos Instruments AG Am Kurpark 3 7270 Davos Platz Switzerland email: markus.suter@davos-instruments.ch

Vuilleumier Laurent Federal Office of Meteorology and Climatology MeteoSwiss Ch. de l'Aérologie 1 1530 Payerne Switzerland email: laurent.vuilleumier@meteoswiss.ch phone: +41 58 460 95 41

Webb Craig Argonne National Lab ARM/DOE 1702 S 3rd St 74631 Blackwell United States email: craigw@ops.sgp.arm.gov phone: 13313183354 or 1-580-262-2306

de Jager Mario GeoSUN 21 Quantum Street, Techno Park 7600 Stellenbosch South Africa email: mario@geosun.co.za phone: +27 21 882 8354 6.2

- AWX: All-weather AHF. A windowed AHF-type pyrheliometer with electric body heater.
- CH(P)1: A type of field pyrheliometer built and marketed by KIPP & ZONEN (OTT HYDROMET B.V.).
- CP20: A type of field pyrheliometer built by HUKSEFLUX THERMAL SENSORS.
- CR: CROM pyrheliometer. A type of cavity pyrheliometer developed by D. Crommelynck.
- CSAR: Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer. A prototype cavity pyrheliometer operating at  $\sim 30$  K. The CSAR was developed and built by PMOD, NPL, and METAS [6].
- DRxx: A type of field pyrheliometer built and marketed by HUKSEFLUX THERMAL SENSORS.
- MSxx: A type of field pyrheliometer built and marketed by EKO INSTRUMENTS CO..
- NIP: Normal Incidence Pyrheliometer. A type of field pyrheliometer built and marketed by EPLAB.
- PAC3: PACRAD 3 pyrheliometer. A prototype cavity pyrheliometer developed by J.M. Kendall and C.M. Berdahl [1].
- PMOD: The Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos, a research institute focusing on radiation and climate research. It was established in 1907 at Davos, Switzerland.
- PMOx: PMO-type pyrheliometer. A type of cavity radiometer originally developed by R.W. Brusa, C. Fröhlich, and J.M. Kendall (PMO1, PMO2, PMO3) [2, 5]. Later iterations of the type were developed by C. Fröhlich and R. Brusa (PMO4, PMO5, PMO6) [4], and M. Suter (PMO8), marketed by DAVOS INSTRUMENTS AG.
- SHP1: A type of field pyrheliometer similar to CHP1 with digital connectivity built and marketed by KIPP & ZONEN (OTT HYDROMET B.V.).
- SNIP: A type of field pyrheliometer similar to the NIP with digital connectivity built and marketed by EPLAB.
- $\bullet\,$  SIAR: SIAR pyrheliomoeter. A type of cavity pyrheliometer developed and built by  ${\rm CIOMP/CAS}.$
- TMI: TMI pyrheliometer. A type of cavity pyrheliometer developed by J.M. Kendall and C.M. Berdahl, built and marketed by TECHNICAL MEASUREMENTS, INC..
- WMO: The World Meteorological Organisation (https:/wmo.int)
- WRC: The World Radiation Centre. The WRC was established at PMOD in 1971, it is mandated by WMO [9].
- WRR: The World Radiometric Reference. A concept introduced in 1977 by WMO to standardize solar irradiance measurements [9].
- WSG: The World Standard Group of pyrheliometers. It serves as the physical realization of the WRR [9].

# Bibliography

- J.M. Kendal Sr. and C.M. Berdahl. "Two Blackbody Radiometers of High Accuracy". In: Applied Optics 9.5 (1970).
- [2] R.W. Brusa and C. Fröhlich. Entwicklung eines neuen Absolutradiometers. Tech. rep. 1. WRC, 1972.
- [3] J.R. Hickey; R.G Frieden; F.J. Griffin; S.A. Cone; R.H. Maschoff and J. Gniady. "The Self-Calibrating Sensor of the Eclectice Satellite Pyrheliometer (ESP) Program". In: Proceedings of the Annual Meeting. ASES. 1977.
- [4] R.W. Brusa and C. Fröhlich. "Absolute radiometrers (PMO6) and their experimental characterization". In: Applied Optics 25.22 (1986).
- [5] A.A. Kmito and Yu.A. Sklyarov. *Pyrheliometry*. Translated from Russian. Amerind Publishing Co. Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi, 1987.
- [6] R. Winkler. "Cryogenic Solar Absolute Radiometer a potential SI standard for solar irradiance". PhD thesis. University College London, 2013.
- [7] W. Finsterle. IPC-XII Final Report. IOM Report No. 124. WMO, 2016.
- [8] IPC-XIII/FRC-V/IPgC-III Symposium. IOM Report No. 138. WMO, 2023.
- [9] Guide to Instruments and Methods of Observation. WMO-No. 8.

For more information, please contact:

## World Meteorological Organization

7 bis, avenue de la Paix – P.O. Box 2300 – CH 1211 Geneva 2 – Switzerland

#### **Communication and Public Affairs Office**

Tel.: +41 (0) 22 730 83 14 – Fax: +41 (0) 22 730 81 71 E-mail: cpa@wmo.int

public.wmo.int